

East Cleveland Public Library
Regular Board of Library Trustees Meeting
December 16, 2019
14101 Euclid Ave. East Cleveland, Ohio 44112
Lower Auditorium 6:30 p.m.

MP3
RBOT 12162019

Mr. Rashid called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER
A. ROLL CALL

Present: Mr. Rashid, Dr. Harris, Ms. McClarin, Mr. Mays, Mr. Silvera, Ms. Shaheed

A quorum exists. Present – 6; Absent -1

Also present at the table were: Mr. Carlos Latimer (Executive Director), Mr. Cockfield (Fiscal Officer), Mr. E.F. Turner III (Exec. Admin. Assistant), Brian Gutkoski (Legal Counsel)

II. LIFT EVERY VOICE AND SING

Everyone is invited to sing.

III. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Rashid: Six present. I'd also like to welcome our people in our audience attending and our attorney. At this point in our agenda, we now want to invite everyone to sing Lift Every Voice and Sing.

Mr. Rashid: I know that the agenda meetings now and that the next item on the agenda is an executive session, but some the members of the board want to change the order of things due to some other issues that are happening now, so ...

Mr. Mays: ...Madam? I mean, not madam. Mr. Chairman?

Mr. Rashid: Yes.

Mr. Mays: I move that we change executive session down to-

Ms. McClarin: Number nine-

Mr. Mays: ... number nine because they have some other activities that young people are coming and we would like to get them in and out of here.

Ms. McClarin: I second.

Mr. Mays: All right, thank you.

Mr. Rashid: There's been a motion and second. Clerk, would you please call the roll?

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (abstain), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Mr. Rashid: Motion is carried by the majority. Next item on our agenda is the approval of the agenda. Is there any discussion or is there a motion to approve the agenda?

Mr. Mays: Mr. Chairman? I move that we approve the agenda as amended.

Ms. McClarin: Second.

Mr. Rashid: There's been a motion and second. Mr. Clerk, would you please call the roll?

Discussion: None

Mr. Mays moved and Ms. McClarin second moving executive session to #9 on the agenda.

Motion approved.

Mr. Mays moved and Ms. McClarin seconds the approval of the amended agenda.

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

The amended agenda is approved.

IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR BOARD MEETING MINUTES FROM NOVEMBER 18, 2019.

Mr. Rashid: Six yeses mean the motion carries. Next item on our agenda is the approval of the minutes for the November 18th, 2019 meeting.

Mr. Mays: Mr. Chairman, I move to approve the minutes of November the 18, 2019 and move for its adoption.

Dr. Harris: Second.

Mr. Rashid: It's been moved and second. Is there any discussion? Hearing none. Mr. Clerk, would you please call the roll for me?

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Mr. Mays moved and Dr. Harris seconds adopting the minutes for 11/18/2019.

Minutes from 11/18/2019 are approved.

V. COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Rashid: The motion carries. Next item on our agenda is communication and award presentations.

Mr. Latimer: Okay, give me one second.

Mr. Rashid: Ms. McClarin? What we're trying to do actually is get in touch with the award recipient to see ... because we understand that they were on their way here and we moved it thinking that they would be here by the time we got to this point in our agenda.

Ms. McClarin: Ms. Shaheed. I'm thinking if you want to, you can accept on his behalf...

Ms. Shaheed: He's in the building.

Ms. McClarin: Oh, great. He's right on time.

Mr. Rashid: Oh, that's great. That's great.

Mr. Rashid: You want your chair?

Ms. McClarin: I'll lean on him. I thought I could... I'll lean on him.

Mr. Rashid: You sure? Because I don't mind bringing it to you.

Ms. McClarin: I didn't want to keep bringing it back and forth. Thank you.

Mr. Rashid: You're welcome.

Mr. Rashid: Are there any other communications? Mr. Director walked out the room.

Mr. Mays: Oh, here he comes.

Mr. Latimer: We're going to go ahead and get started for our first recipient. This young lady, I think she's in the building somewhere. She participated in our summer reading club and we're going to let her tell us what she did this summer. I'm going to read the award. Actually, it's giving away to answer. Madison Monet Hatcher, please stand up. [applause] For reading 75 books East Cleveland Public Library summer reading club,

congratulations. Tell us all about your experience this summer at the library. This is yours.

Madison: Heavy. I had a great time this summer. It was a great experience. I love reading books. It's very interesting to me, and our mother always told me that reading is very good for your brain and that it's very educational for me.

Mr. Rashid: Can I ask a question? What is your favorite book? Is there a favorite out of 75 books?

Madison: It was a book by James Patterson.

Mr. Shaheed: Oh my goodness, James Patterson.

Mr. Rashid: Congratulations to you. (applause).

Madison: Thank you.

Ms. McClarin: Congratulations.

Mr. Latimer: Okay. The family's here.

Mr. Rashid: Do you want to introduce your family to us?

Marcia Hatcher: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm so busy trying to keep one in order. I'm Marcia Hatcher. Madison and Marshawn, Mason, and this is my grandson. Madison Joy. She is gifted, so we want to keep her in that, right? So many outside influences that pull our children away, but we try to stay on it, and with the help of the community, I thank you all so much for recognizing the children, because without recognition and introducing them ... So excited to be here for her at a board meeting. So again, thank you all for recognizing our children.

Mr. Rashid: We want to thank you too.

Ms. McClarin: Thank you.

Mr. Rashid: Thank you. Without parents like you, there would not be children like that.

Mr. Latimer: Thank you again for the board and for the staff, we appreciate your family. Okay. Our next award is, we understand our challenges here in East Cleveland and we have community members who care about our families, our children. There were so many weekends this summer, close to the holidays. We had a brother reach out to the library to bring resources. One of the most important resources is on

the weekends, during the day. Anytime. Our family members are hungry. They want food, and on so many occasions this year, we had this young man bring his team down to the East Cleveland Public Library, bring a whole team of other partners passing out baby toys, diapers, most importantly, nutrition; feeding our community. With this to Mr. Mukhtar Shaheed, the East Cleveland Public Library for your steadfast service to the patrons, the community of the East Cleveland Public Library in 2019. Thank you.

Mr. Shaheed: Well, first of all, I'm not long with speeches. I was very humbled and surprised that I was getting anything. When we started off doing this, it was definitely something that we saw from the heart. I have an affinity towards East Cleveland because my mother was a teacher in Shaw for over 36 years. So I felt that it was natural. It was the right thing to do. And there's something as far as the passion that I have as it relates to dealing with other people other than myself.

Mr. Shaheed: There's a short story. This is something that inspires me to do what I do. There was a tradition that was related that there was a man who had given some ... There's a difference of opinion on how the story goes. But one says that he knew who the people were and some said he didn't, but it was one, he had given charity to a woman who was actually a prostitute. And then another time he gave a charity to a person who was a thief. And then he gave charity to a person who was rich. An, so he said that when he found out who these people were or he knew who they were, he said that, "I gave the prostitute money because maybe that stopped her from committing an immoral act that day." And then he said, "I gave the thief money because that stopped him from maybe harming somebody that day. And I gave the rich man money in order to inspire him to give what he had to other people."

Mr. Shaheed: So, you don't ever know. We don't ever know. When I see those little kids, when I see those babies that 20 years from now, that they might remember something that somebody did for them and it inspires them to do what they can do for somebody else. So, that's a constant inspiration. I want to thank my parents; I want to thank my family. They definitely are inspiration to me. Any idea that I come up with, they're always there to support me and to do what I do. I would not be able to be successful without the help and support in my family. So, thanks everybody. (applause)

Mr. Rashid: My name is Zakee Rashid.

Mr. Shaheed: Oh, good to meet you.

Mr. Rashid: And as you speak of your mother, I want to tell you that she was the first black history teacher in the East Cleveland school systems that hired one of her pupils.

Mr. Shaheed: Oh, wonderful.

Mr. Rashid: She had a lot to do with shaping the way that I think, then even up until today, it's her influence on me. So I know why you're standing there, my brother. Thank you.

Mr. Shaheed: Oh, thank you so much.

Ms. McClarin: Ms. Shaheed do it. Just stand up for a minute-

Ms. Shaheed: Yes, ma'am.

Ms. McClarin: And then we're going to recognize the family that came out today.

Ms. Shaheed: Stand up.

Ms. McClarin: Yeah, thank god for you, the family is here. I want to say when Ms. Shaheed joined the library board, she came in working, and you can see in the result that she's bringing and she brought her family with her and this young man had fed over and clothed over 600 community members from East Cleveland. We really appreciate the work that you all do, and we say god bless you all. Keep up the great work.

Mr. Mays: And I have to say to you, your mother did well.

Mr. Shaheed: I appreciate that.

Ms. Shaheed: Thank you Mr. Mays.

Mr. Latimer: The last communications.

Mr. Latimer: This is an easy award to recognize. We have an organization that's connected to the East Cleveland Public Library. It's our friend. The friends of East Cleveland Public Library for the work and commitment and the engagement within the community, but for their contribution to many of the programs that we asked for support this year. Our Halloween program, our summer reading club where they purchased and donated bicycles, whether it was a cash donation for Halloween program.

Mr. Latimer: But we have a regular staff member that attends the friends meetings. I had the opportunity to participate in the annual meeting. They were very nice to me and we look forward to working with them in the

future. So, we'd like to congratulate and thank the friends. Mr. Billingsley, come on up.

Ms. McClarin: We wanted them to take the paper off because we didn't want to break it, so you're allowed to take the paper off.

Mr. Billingsley: Oh, okay.

Mr. Turner: That's a lot of paper. That's a lot of paper.

Mr. Mays: Oh my goodness. Look at all that paper.

Ms. McClarin: That's a lot of paper.

Mr. Billingsley: It says "The Friends of the East Cleveland Public Library in appreciation of your commitment to excellence, East Cleveland Public Library".

Ms. McClarin: And the reason that you have a vase, a vase is something you constantly put flowers in it and constantly pour water in it. That's what we think about the Friends of the Library, constantly pouring into us.

Mr. Rashid: Well said. Well said.

Mr. Billingsley: I just make a few comments about ...

Ms. McClarin: Don't forget...

Mr. Billingsley: Pardon?

Ms. McClarin: Everyone else...

Mr. Billingsley: Oh, yes, there's Ross, there's Pam. Any other members here?

Mr. Rashid: Please stand. Please stand. (applause)

Mr. Billingsley: Just so you know, the friends have been around for 50 years supporting the library. Over 50 years supporting the library and we just continuing on doing that. Maybe I could just mention one other thing that everybody may not be aware of that the friends do. We have rec programs that we have supported and recently we have a program at Shaw High School, after school program, music program and we have mentors come in and teach students instruments and voice. Recently we were asked to join with Karamu with sound and lighting. We do sound and lighting here with a grant program so now we're going to be joining Karamu with their program. We'll be joining it together so the friends are joining the other branches that we support

besides the library, but we do a lot of other things in the community, trying to support some the things that are needed. This is just one of the things that we do support the library and we'll continue to do that.

Group: Thank you.

Mr. Latimer: Also, for putting all this together, let's thank our board member Pam McClarin for her work.

Mr. Rashid: Yes, kindly.

Mr. Latimer: And Ms. Flood and her team for helping us put it together as well.

Mr. Rashid: Thank you.

Mr. Latimer: That concludes communications.

VI. FISCAL OFFICER'S REPORT (R. COCKFIELD)

Mr. Rashid: Well, concluding communications, the next item on our agenda is our Fiscal Officer's end of the year presentation, Mr. Ross Cockfield.

Mr. Cockfield: You want to go first?

Mr. Latimer: They had you go first.

Mr. Cockfield: Oh, okay. Can everyone see? Well thank you. This is not going to be very lengthy, but basically what we try to do at the end of the year is give everyone an overview of our performance financially. You've already wanted a sense of some the things that we had attempted to do, what our successes were, and what our challenges are going to be moving forward. So as you can see, this is an overview of financial performance 2019 presented by Mr. Carlos Latimer who was our director and myself, the library's Fiscal Officer.

Mr. Cockfield: The agenda for the presentation is basically a summary of highlights, revenue and support expenditures, comparison, and then talk about 2019 projections. Over here just a note that the East Cleveland Public Library's serving East Cleveland and the greater Cleveland community. This presentation provides an overview of our financial performance for the year and all information presented is available to the public. Okay.

Mr. Cockfield: Just from a sense of comparison, just to show that last year we started the year January 1 of 2018 with a fund balance of \$363,063. This year we're projecting a fund balance of \$486,219. Just kind of take you right to the bottom. What we're anticipating at the end of this year, as you can see the comparisons, we had \$486,219 at 12/31 of '18. We're anticipating an increase of 715,327. It's about quite an increase of \$230,000. Now, this is as a result of a couple things. One, we've received some grants which were applied directly to our general fund. Secondly, Mr. Latimer has instituted some very stringent cost saving measures. We do a lot of budgeting, a lot of budget planning, and so as a result of this, there have been some staff changes. Nothing very major. But as a result of this, we're seeing an increase in our fund balances going into 2020, which is a good thing. It's a very good thing.

Mr. Rashid: A really good thing.

Mr. Mays: But that's somewhat predicated on those grants that you've received.

Mr. Cockfield: Some of them. Some the grants, you'll see a little further into the presentation, but we received roughly \$100,000 in grants this year. About 50,000 of that 100 was applied to our general fund. The other 50 was applied to our performing arts fund.

Mr. Mays: So, they're not giving you any direction how you should spend it or what you should spend it on...

Mr. Cockfield: Oh, yes, yes, yes. No, the grants are restricted. They're restricted to use, but they're not restricted to the funding they're applied to. So we applied these to our general fund. And as I said though that the other, which was our grant coming from the Cleveland Foundation, was applied to our performing arts fund, which funds our jazz concerts and those performances.

Mr. Mays: I'm kind of lost here because if the grants are earmarked for a certain ...

Mr. Cockfield: Yeah, they're earmarked for a purpose. But it doesn't say that they are restricted to a particular fund.

Mr. Mays: Oh, okay.

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Mr. Rashid: So, with us being almost two and a half weeks into December, we're pretty firm about, that's going to be the number by year end.

Mr. Cockfield: We're pretty close. We have a few checks. When I say a few checks, we probably ... We have another payroll to process, health insurance to pay. So we're about 50,000 dollars in question, plus the miscellaneous expenses and you want to close out with, but this is pretty close. That's pretty close.

Mr. Rashid: Okay. Okay. Thank you very much because that's still an improvement over where we ended up at in '18, although we actually seem to have received less appropriations in '19. We still ended up with a better balance. So that really lets you know that the director is being very prudent about how he spends out money and you're being very good about how you handle our affairs.

Mr. Cockfield: If you notice here, our total expenditures are very close, but our revenue support is what increased.

Mr. Rashid: Exactly. Okay.

Mr. Cockfield: One of the things that is significant from our standpoint is the new accounting system that we're implementing. These are some things that we intend for the accounting system do for us; improve financial reporting. One of the things that drove us toward the purchase of the accounting system itself was the fact that the accounting system allows us to manage various projects. What we do, we tend to think of a project as a bucket so to speak, and we throw things into that bucket and then we report out the activity of that bucket. So you have revenue coming into that bucket. You have expenses that are charged to that bucket. So, that bucket can cover all kinds of operation. I mean, it can cross operation barriers and again, this is one of the features of the program that is very appealing.

Mr. Cockfield: The other thing is the fact that the program manages grants. We were able to secure about \$100,000 this year in grant revenue and this is one of the things that we intend to use going forward more extensively. You know, the grant reporting features of the program. Fourth, the program performance allocations. Now, this is something we're not doing at this point, but something that we intend to move into. Basically what this means is that we're able to charge certain costs to overhead versus particular operating line items.

Mr. Cockfield: The fifth thing is that the program allows us to streamline operations. One of the things that we're getting ready to implement in the beginning of the year is an automated requisition process whereby the managers would be entering the requisitions for purchase. Those requisitions automatically transmitted to our director for approval. Once he approves, the purchase order is automatically created. The purchase order then goes back to the managers for them to order.

Invoice comes in and we pay against the purchase order. So what it does is that it eliminates paper handling, papers being lost. Obviously you know what happens when papers get lost.

Mr. Rashid: I have a question about the grants. So even though the \$100,000 went into the general fund, the grant ... the way that it manages the grants, it'll tell you as you spend that \$100,000. Does it kind of hold it in a bucket and then it just allow you to spend it?

Mr. Cockfield: Mm-hmm (affirmative).

Mr. Rashid: Okay.

Mr. Cockfield: Yeah. We'll be able to give very specific reports having to do with the grants. What we spent the grants, what the grant expenditures were when they were made, those kinds of things.

Mr. Rashid: And does it print a report so if the person that gave us the grant wants to read out how we spent it-

Mr. Cockfield: Oh, yes.

Mr. Rashid: ... it would generate that for them?

Mr. Cockfield: Oh, yes.

Mr. Rashid: That's good. That's very important as well.

Mr. Cockfield: Yeah. One of the things that we got bogged down with was, needless to say, everybody wants to use a spreadsheet for everything.

Mr. Rashid: Mm-hmm (affirmative).

Mr. Cockfield: One of the difficulties in doing that though is that in merging the spreadsheet data with the accounting system, it becomes problematic because if you're not able to seamlessly integrate that information in information can be misapplied, posted incorrectly, that kind of thing. So what the system allows us to do is to enter the information one time, add that information then flow through the system and report back out.

Mr. Mays: Is this a revolving grant or just a one-time grant?

Mr. Cockfield: Depends. It depends. I know the performing arts grant, I know Mr. Reese is currently trying to get that reinstated. I don't know where that stands at this point, but that's something he's trying to do. The second thing that was significant this year was the PACE financing which we

received. PACE is the property assessed clean energy. The financing allowed us to secure a brand new boiler system for the library and the significance of the PACE financing was the fact that it allowed us to spread the financing cost over the useful life of the project. So the cost of the financing, which is actually assessed on the property, assessed to the library, will carry out over 10 years, which is roughly the life of the boiler project. Secondly, it allowed us to improve our cashflow management. And third, the energy savings were designed to equal the financing cost which essentially is a net zero type of a proposition. Yes?

Mr. Rashid: One question I had about the financing. The assessment against the library, does it reduce each year as we continue to pay back the money that we borrow?

Mr. Cockfield: No. The assessment is roughly \$30,000 a year to be paid over the... Course of until it disappears.

Mr. Rashid: So, the assessment of the library is for the entire amount of the loan

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Mr. Rashid: But each year when we pay, we pay 30 grand each year just theoretically. Then next year...

Mr. Cockfield: We're paying the loan down, yes.

Mr. Rashid: That's what I'm saying. The assessment doesn't just stay at the same amount.

Mr. Cockfield: No. No.

Mr. Rashid: It continues to decrease each year as we pay it down.

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Mr. Rashid: Okay. That was my question. Thank you.

Mr. Cockfield: The last thing I just wanted to point out is that we've received roughly \$102,796 in grant monies. You can see that we have three coming from the Cleveland Foundation, the Reinberger Foundation, and the last one from is the United Black Fund in the way of a grant from chess. I'm going to put it out here, so just mark the calendar. The library is going to be hosting a citywide chess tournament at the end of March, open to residents and students of the East Cleveland City School District. Only. It'll be held here at the library over a two day period.

Mr. Mays: So they would be competing with each other?

Mr. Cockfield: Yes. Yes.

Dr. Harris: Do you have a date set yet?

Mr. Cockfield: March 29th and 30th I believe. It's the Friday and Saturday, the last day of the spring break. That Friday and then the following Saturday, or the next Saturday.

Mr. Mays: This chess thing has gotten off the ground?

Mr. Cockfield: Yes. We also have a very well qualified chess instructor that comes in on Tuesday and Thursday. So as we get the information out to the public, we're hoping that people who want to improve their game will come to the library and get themselves ready.

Mr. Mays: I don't play very well.

Mr. Cockfield: There's always a question of where does library get its money? Based on these percentages, you can see that we have basically two major sources of revenue. One is the public library fund. The other over there is property taxes. We get about 4% of our revenue from fines, grants, interest, and other sources. And we have an intergovernmental receipt of 4.9% that comes in. It's a homestead exemption and this is basically a source of ... This is the breakdown, if you will, of how we get funded.

Mr. Mays: What is that over there on the end?

Mr. Cockfield: I'm sorry?

Mr. Mays: That one, what is that?

Mr. Cockfield: Public Library Fund, PLF. This is a monthly distribution. This comes in semi-annually. And how do we spend our money? Roughly 20% goes to public services and programs. 10% collection, development and processing. Information services, 13.5%. Facilities and maintenance, 18.4% and general overhead administration, about 33%. And capital outlay essentially is on furniture and equipment purchases, and that's roughly 2.3%.

Mr. Cockfield: This hopes to give a kind of a comparison from year to year of revenues, expenses and fund balances. So you can see everything just kind of fluctuates in between two and a half million and 200 million or two million. Closer to two and a half million. Here we are 2019 where our revenues are slightly above two and a half million,

expenses a little bit below two and a half. And here's the change in fund balance, so you can see that as this increases, this decreases, this increases. And going forward, last slide is basically to continue the implementation of cost savings measures. So the accounting system and working with Mr. Latimer. Secondly, to take advantage of the new accounting system to ensure program budgeting and departmental cost control. And needless to say, we're constantly seeking grants and proposals, and that's it. Any questions?

- Mr. Rashid: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Mr. Cockfield.
- Mr. Silvera: Mr. Chair, I move that we accept the Fiscal Officer's presentation.
- Dr. Harris: Second.
- Mr. Rashid: There's a movement and a second.
- Mr. Rashid: Please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Mr. Silvera moved and Dr. Harris seconds approval of the Fiscal Officer's report.

The Fiscal Officer's report is approved.

VII. DIRECTOR'S REPORT (C. LATIMER)

- Mr. Rashid: So move, approved, and accepted.
- Mr. Rashid: All right. That concludes our financial officer's end of the year presentation. Next item on our agenda is the Director's end of year presentation by Mr. Latimer.

Mr. Latimer: Okay, good evening again. This is the 2019 year review. First of all, we'd like to thank the leadership of the library, the board; they're all smiling happier moments. President Terra Turner, Zakee Rashid vice president, Dr. Mary Ann Harris, secretary, Carol Shaheed, Otis Mays, Pamela McClarin and Gerald Silvera. We'd also like to recognize the work the Board did this year. We had our 11 scheduled meetings plus the special meeting for a total of 12 scheduled meeting, and our Board passed 33 resolutions, so let's give a Board a hand for their work. (applause)

Mr. Latimer: Those resolutions all came through our committee work. Recognize the committee and their hard work. Personnel, Pamela McClarin, Carol Shaheed. Library Services, Carol Shaheed by herself. We had some fill-ins there. Buildings and Grounds, Mr. Mays and Mr. Rashid. Finance, Mr. Rashid, Mr. Silvera, and strategic planning, Dr. Harris, Pam McClarin, and Mr. Silvera. So, great work, committee members. We would also like to thank the personnel and the board and the community. Thank you for trusting me with the keys and to leading this library, and putting us in place. We have a great administrative staff.

Mr. Mays: Do you recognize that person there?

Mr. Latimer: It's President Obama. That was me. I'm happy to be the Executive Director of East Cleveland Public Library. So thank you very much.

Mr. Latimer: We have a great team to help me lead this library. Also many thanks to our partners. Mr. Cockfield talked about all the funds that we received, the Cleveland Foundation, the Reinberger Foundation, United Black Fund, Friends of the East Cleveland Public Library. Thank you very much. We also want to talk about some of the new services that we implemented in 2019. We are already the destination for our community to receive passports, so that is a new service we introduced in 2019.

Mr. Rashid: Please give Ms. McClarin her recognition.

Mr. Rashid: Ms. McClarin?

Mr. Latimer: Ms. McClarin? Thank you.

Ms. McClarin: Thank you.

Mr. Latimer: Notary services is something we had a resolution around, it's a service that we provide. We have I think up to seven staff members that are trained to be notaries, so we offer that service to our community. We partner for adult education to assist some of our

students to prepare for GED, so we partnered with Aspire for that initiative. We added 80 hotspots to our collection thanks to the Cleveland Foundation. There are many residents in the city of East Cleveland that don't have internet access and we know for our students, having access to the internet assists them in getting that homework and projects and things like that done. So we have a total of 80 hotspots. Hopefully we can continue to increase that.

Mr. Latimer: One of our other new services we provide, we were a passport for computer assistance where the community members would come into the library, learn how to use the computer and through our partnership with Computers Assisting People, they donated the hardware. So we had 15 refurbished computers taken to homes by our staff in need. So, that was a great initiative, great partnership.

Mr. Mays: Just go back for a minute to the hotspots. They're being used very well and return well?

Mr. Latimer: Yes, the hotspots is one of the more popular technology services that we introduced to the community. We had them in before I got here, but we did increase with the work from our team. They all go out. There's always a waiting list on those hotspots. We are not at 100% of those being returned. However, within those 30 days they all eventually get returned back into the collection. So we have a really good policy in place which the Cleveland Foundation looked at our policy and was part of us getting more

Mr. Mays: So, they're turned off if they're not returned at a certain time.

Mr. Latimer: That is correct. There's no incentive for someone to keep a hotspot because it becomes dead technology. You can't turn it on. We have controls of that if it's not returned. We also invested in purchase of titles around the Coretta Scott King Award winning books. These are culturally relevant books where children see people that look like them around stories that they can relate to. So we have a very comprehensive collection of Coretta Scott King Award winning books at our library. That was an investment made by the board and our library.

Mr. Latimer: We also updated our lighting in the reference area. This picture doesn't tell the whole story. However, when you go out into the intro area, you'll see how bright the light we have. Our next goal, with the money that we're carrying over into 2020, is to do some upgrades to that space. So we're constantly looking for capital improvements to make it better for our community.

Mr. Mays: How far we are along on that project?

Mr. Latimer: This project is complete.

Mr. Mays: It has been completed, okay.

Mr. Latimer: Where have we been? Here's before and here's after.

Dr. Rice: Wow.

Mr. Latimer: The Boiler.

Group: (Applause.)

Mr. Mays: I can't clap until I know it is complete.

Mr. Rashid: It'll be fine, Mr. Mays. It's going to be fine.

Mr. Latimer: We have heat in the library. Some spaces there is a lot of heat. But we have a 21st century state the art equipment, which is, let's give our Board a hand again. As of today, I believe ... I checked in with Mr. Cooper, our maintenance manager and Ms. Flood. There was a training today around the controls? Is Ms. Flood back there? Ms. Flood?

Ms. Flood: Oh, huh?

Mr. Mays: Wake up.

Mr. Latimer: Was there a training today around the automation?

Ms. Flood: Yes. It was a training on how to use the interface of it because now it's graphical, The (GUI) graphical user interface with 3-D where Mr. Cooper will be able to control it from his desktop or from home in case anything happens like he's on vacation or something like that. But it's very high tech, technical and the GUI is superb, so he'll take you all around and show it to you all one day. I guess maybe next week, I'm not sure.

Mr. Latimer: Mr. Mays, we're 99.9. Once we get that punch list to sign off on and the project is done. We will call you.

Mr. Latimer: We also updated 2019 our website, thanks to Ms. Flood and our technology team, so we have a very up to date website. It has a lot of high traffic, offers everything what we offer to the community. Performing arts concerts. This is another grant from the Cleveland Foundation.

Mr. Mays: Question. Question.

Mr. Latimer: Yes, sir.

Mr. Cockfield: No, no question. I just wanted to point out that the website allowed us to save money because we were farming that service out and now we have the service in-house and it's being formed in-house.

Mr. Latimer: Thank you. Part of our programming, once a month through the Cleveland Foundation and working with our previous director, Greg Reese, we have these high profile concerts in the Greg Reese Performing Arts Center every Sunday with the partnership with the friends as well as great ushers. We feel that auditorium up with high quality music, Vanessa Rubin, Jerome Jennings, Greg Bandy, Bobby Floyd Trio, Forecast, Voices of Gospel, Horns and Things, Sammy De Leon, Voices of Jazz, Jazz Keepers. Mr. Silvera has been in attendance. I recommend that everyone, all board members to attend. We are working on the schedule for next year, which that Sunday before Martin Luther King will be the kickoff of the new series.

Mr. Mays: Does this generate any revenue or just free?

Mr. Latimer: Because we are a public library, when we open to the community, we cannot charge residents for ticket pricing and things like that. And so, it's free to the community.

Mr. Mays: So if someone wished to employ them or what have you, would that be a charge that we could charge there?

Mr. Latimer: What do you mean, employ them?

Mr. Mays: Say for an example, the people that's participating in this performance.

Mr. Latimer: The musicians?

Mr. Mays: Yes. For an example, say I just use myself for an example. If I wish to employ them, to come back here to perform at charge, would that be outside of the norms?

Mr. Latimer: No. That's something we can look at in 2020, part of our policy to outside of our operating hours.

Mr. Mays: Yes.

Mr. Latimer: If someone wants to rent the facility, yes, that can happen, and they can charge for admission.

Mr. Rashid: But that would not be a function of the library. That would be a function of the independent third party.

Mr. Mays: Yeah, but then we would have to pay the library for using the facilities.

Mr. Latimer: Yes, that is correct. that would be a part of our fines and fees schedule and our performance arts center usage policy. So with this series, we have a special gift for our board of trustee meetings and support, and a thank-you for allowing us to perform these concerts, which is well received by our community. Everywhere I go in the community they talk about how great these concerts are, what a gift these concerts are to our community. So, thank you.

Mr. Latimer: What we're going to do at the next concert, we're going to raffle off both ... We got two extra ones. We're going to wrap them off. The highlight of 2019 events, the Shirelda Helen Terry tribute we do every year, Wives Against Suicide and Violence, our partnership with Rainy Institute, our Babies, Books, and Bags, community baby shower. We had a Great Lakes African Writers Conference where we brought people in from all over the country. We had the Tale of Two Cities, Artography reception and exhibit. We also partnered as part of our jazz program. We did a jazz literacy program with East Cleveland schools. That went well. We had students come into the building. Our summer reading club, we had an increase of children that participated. Our connected library card, founder's day, library card sign-up campaign.

Mr. Latimer: We had 60,000 residents walk into the library. We had 20,000 visit the career center. We checked out 54,000 items. We 442 hotspots. This is real dear to me. We introduced 920 new people to the library. Computer classes attended, 1,600. Adults, 924. Our teen programs, which is real dear to me. We had 1,300 teens attend a children's program, which is critical. 1,110 attend. We also threw the ... after school snack program has been in place, which something we need to continue. We passed out 6,619 lunches after school. Our technology team, social media, something we introduced to our community. We have 1,394 followers. So that's our community impact. And we did our traditional Halloween events, Christmas, which is ... We partnered with Toys for Tots. So this year our children like last year will receive gifts. So, we were looking forward to 2020.

Mr. Mays: Mr. Latimer, how do you promote these activities taking place in the library?

Mr. Latimer: All the activities in the library we promote through website, social media, through flyers and through word of mouth of being out in the community from board members to staff and a lot of the partners that

we have; Salvation Army. We have council members that come in and pick up flyers. We have school board members that come in and take information as well. It's done through a strategy and it's done organically as well.

Mr. Mays: Thank you.

Mr. Latimer: Thank you.

Ms. Shaheed: Good job.

Mr. Mays: Mr. Chairman.

Mr. Rashid: The Directors report, may I have a motion to accept? Dr. Harris?

Dr. Harris: I move for acceptance of the director's report.

Mr. Silvera: I second.

Mr. Rashid: It's been moved to second. Please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Dr. Harris moved and Mr. Silvera seconds the approval of the Director's report.

The Director's report is approved.

VIII. EXECUTIVE SESSION: TO DISCUSS LEGAL MATTERS WITH ATTORNEY

Mr. Rashid: What we did is we switched some items in the beginning of our meeting, from executive session as being the third item to where we are now in the meeting. And so at this point we are supposed to go into an executive session, but I want to poll the board to see if we can we move that to the last item and at least we can let all these people that attended this, we can go through the rest of the meeting and then do our executive session at the end. Would there be consideration for that?

Mr. Gutkoski: Vice president, I'm not sure this is something that needs to be talked about in executive session. It's not an actual pending legal matter.

Mr. Rashid: Well, I'm glad to hear it.

Mr. Gutkoski: We could talk about it openly. It's an open secret.

Mr. Mays: Right. Right. I agree with that.

Mr. Rashid: Having said that as our attorney, we're at the point in the meeting now where we can open our discussion for us.

Mr. Gutkoski: Sure. Ms. Turner asked for an opinion from me with respect to your seat. It's my understanding that you guys serve on a rolling seven year term and every one of you as of October 31st needs to get reappointed by the board of the schools. And I guess that didn't happen. And the 45 days, I think ran maybe last week.

Judge Keenon: Yesterday.

Mr. Gutkoski: Right. And I talked to Dr. Rice as well today, and I told her the same thing I'm telling you guys now and what I told Tara (Turner) is that the statute says what it says and I wouldn't anticipate the probate court would do anything different with the slate of candidates that it's tendered to the probate court. But it seems to me the statute's clear that appointment is to be done by the probate court now at this point, because the statute says if it's not done within the 45 days, then it shall be done by the probate court within 14 days or after. So that's what the period we're in now.

Mr. Mays: Question, Mr ...

Mr. Turner: Gutkoski.

Mr. Mays: Gutkoski. This matter did not come before the board. Now, one single board number going to call you to say that this person, the same

question, time is up on this board, and I have a problem with that. We are a seven member board. One board member goes running, and instead of discussing this matter with us or find out what was going on, and it's my understanding that there was some problems with I guess with paperwork, with the appointing authority, which is the school board.

Mr. Mays: And so that's where the problem came in and I cannot see where this arose to a point whereas it's going to remove the person that time is up on this board and the appointing authority kind of agrees that there was some mix up there they had and they had no problem with it. And I don't think the majority of this board has any problem with it. I don't see where this has to now go to court and all this matter. This matter can be eradicated right here. There is nothing wrong with the point in authority says the person remained until they are able to appoint someone. And it's my understanding that no one has applied except the person that is sitting now. And so I just cannot see why this has to come to this. It just doesn't make sense to me.

Mr. Gutkoski: I mean, in response to your question, I sent the actual language of the statute to the board's email. I don't know if you guys got a chance to review it, but 3375.15(C) is pretty clear. It says quote, "The board of education shall make appointments to the board of library trustees not later than 45 days after the date member's term expires or after the date of vacancy occurs, whichever is applicable."

Mr. Gutkoski: That's the first sentence. So at this point, applying to the facts here, Mr. Rashid's term expired. We're all in agreement that on October 31st, 2019, and 45 days from that date is December 15th. The next sentence of the statute says if the board of education does not make an appointment by that time, the appointment shall be made within the next 14 days by the probate court of the county in which library is situated. So it doesn't say that there has to be some sort of filing her court case. It just says that that power to appoint Mr. Rashid is vested no longer in the school board but in a probate judge of the county, so it's my understanding somebody simply needs to notify the probate court or the need that this person be re-nominated within the next 14 days.

Mr. Gutkoski: It's my understanding that there's been an open enrollment and to see if there's any community interest for anyone else to serve in that capacity. If there's not, then obviously this is the probate court's job will be really simple, only one person applying for the candidate. It seems to me that the probate court would certainly continue the appointment of the guy that's been doing the job, but again, that's not my prognostication as to who the probate court is going to appoint. All

I can tell you is this is what the statute says and it seems pretty clear to me.

Judge Keenon: As the president of school board. First, I want to say that we were given obviously bad information in regards to when Mr. Rashid's term would end. We had it ... and this list came from the library on April 12th, 2018. We had it that his term would end in 2021. It was brought to my attention then we started working on it, but we started to first try to decide when his term would end. Yesterday would be the end of that term that we're talking about today.

Judge Keenon: But we have also put an ad in the paper as we usually do, and the only one answered the ad was Mr. Rashid. So we don't have any other applicants this point. We've also been in touch with probate court as of today and we're just waiting for ... We're both from the school board. Send it to the probate court and we believe that that's going to come right back to Mr. Rashid. So it's not going to be a problem.

Mr. Gutkoski: I wouldn't anticipate it would be a problem.

Judge Keenon: I received no kinds of calls about whether he should sit today, whether or not he should come. He hasn't vacated his seat. His seat hasn't been vacated and when he took his oath of office, it says until his seat is filled, he could sit in that seat until that time comes. So it really isn't a need to really have a lot of conversation...

Mr. Gutkoski: ...I don't see the need..

Judge Keenon: ...Nobody but Mr. Rashid.

Mr. Gutkoski: Yeah, I see the need to file any sort of case or something like that.

Mr. Rashid: Dr. Rice, Do you have anything?

Dr. Rice: No, I don't have anything to add. I questioned the October 31st date. That's all the questions but I will do the research on that myself and I will get back with you with what I find on that. Other than that, there is no one. I know the board and we have a five member board and I've talked to just about all of them. It's just a moot thing right now.

Judge Keenon: I did understand after a while because we were given this slip. Then we got a slip that says Mr. Rashid took Mr. Silvera's place. It was a whole different sheet from what they'd been given us before. This was what we were going by to start with. And then when I received the message from Ms. Turner, I tried to figure out what on earth was going on. So yesterday was our last day and it's not, I suppose what

falls on a Sunday becomes Monday, which wouldn't help anyway because we still have to get the vote. So I think in doing the way we're doing it now, we're pretty much saying 99% that Mr. Rashid is going to be appointed. As I said, he's the only one that even made the effort to ask for it.

Mr. Mays: And I thank you for coming out, but I would like to see you here at every meeting, but not just when one person goes down and whomever, one or two or whoever or three or whoever went down there. We operate as a board, not one person that takes precedent over this board. And so for that person, whoever went trotting down there or what have you, instead of consulting with this board, that's where my problem comes in. And then my understanding, oh, he can't sit and he won't preside.

Mr. Mays: He is the vice president. So, he's sitting and I think that is in keeping ... if there was some problem ... Anyway, I think it should've come before the full board and not involving you and I think we could have eradicated this problem in-house as opposed to going outside because you're not maybe not cognizant of it. There is a move and there is some clique-ish stuff going on and I would say that in public on the record because they did not want him becoming the president. That's all it's about.

Mr. Rashid: Mr. Mays...

Mr. Mays: ...No. I'm just going to get it out here. Whereas the public will know, that's what's going on here.

Mr. Rashid: I would also like to ... Board would like to recognize Ms. McClarin.

Ms. McClarin: Yes. I would like to say it's been cleared up. The main thing that the board was concerned about ... We didn't know as the judge said, should Mr. Rashid be ... I mean, that he'd be able to sit here or come back or whatever. I thank God for the school board members and the lawyer being here to get all of that cleared up. That's the only thing we need. Because we thought that we would know how to proceed, for this December meeting and that's all it was. Don't know what ... All that over stuff. There ain't no clique here and all that, whatever, crystal balls and all that stuff. So, thank you all for coming and helping us get through this December meeting.

Mr. Rashid: And I want to say thank you to the school board representatives that came tonight too especially. Thank you for having confidence in me to appoint me in the first place and for the re-appointment that we hope will happen soon. Thank you so very much. I promise to do the best I can to continue to represent the city, represent you, and represent the

citizens of the city of East Cleveland. Thank you very much. Thank you. Thank you so much.

Ms. McClarin: Yeah, we're going to work on that next year, judge, with the new officers and new secretary. We going to make sure no loopholes going to be coming through this library. And the thing being, it was important we all go through this process, because it's legally binding, and that was the thing. We didn't want to be guessing and all this and that. Like I say, a loophole fell somewhere between getting the right to the school board. So, just a prime example of we can't afford that.

Mr. Rashid: Since we're in this particular forum, if a member of the school board wants to say something... Dr. Rice?

Dr. Rice: It's a public comment. I make my comments as a member of the East Cleveland public. Couple things. What a great idea to share the year-end report to the community. I wonder where such a great idea originated.

Mr. Mays: Came from you.

Dr. Rice: Anyone I know?

Mr. Mays: Dr. Rice.

Dr. Rice: Yes. That was what I did as president because such a great library and I wanted to make sure that each year we reported to the community. I am so happy to see that you're still giving out the year-end report. It's just so important that the community know what an asset this library is and not only that, how well the library is doing. At one point when I was there, it was kind of rocky, so therefore I just wanted to make sure that they know that we were on solid ground, so thank you very much for keeping that going.

Dr. Rice: Second, I just want to publicly acknowledge the library computer staff on the second floor. Wow. I am so thrilled because as someone who really doesn't know a great deal about computers, I came in and they were so helpful to me. But while I was there I saw a guy, senior citizen who's much older than I am. He came in and he was really... Didn't know his head from his toes and they helped him and then I kept staying it for a while because it took a while for them to help me. Then I saw another young lady came in and they were so helpful to her trying to get a resume together and what have you.

Dr. Rice: That's the kind services. That is why I'm so proud of the East Cleveland Public Library. The job that you do. And the last thing that I have to say is this, you know when I was here I fought and I fought

hard to make sure that that that property behind the library didn't go anywhere. There are a couple people that before we completed interviews on the library board, I talked about that property behind here that it didn't go anywhere and to keep an eye on and I'm trusting the library trustees that you're keeping that property and the East Cleveland Public Library, this community needs that property. Keep an eye on it, because there are some crooks trying to get it. Thank you very much. Keep doing such a great job. I appreciate all of you.

Mr. Mays: Thank you. Thank you.

Mr. Rashid: Thank you so much.

Mr. Mays: Judge Keenon.

Dr. Rice: The judge.

Mr. Rashid: Judge Keenon, I'm sorry.

Judge Keenon: I just wanted to say, I remember years ago, not a long time ago, but years ago when the board of the library came to the school board and said, we need to give the library to the county. Remember that?

Group: Yes.

Judge Keenon: They wanted to give this library away. But we fought hard in order to keep it.

Judge Keenon: And I want you to know that I am so happy with the way you've done, with what you've done with it and I'm so proud to say we kept it for the right reasons and for the right people.

IX. NEW BUSINESS

A. Resolution 12-01-2019: To Approve 2020 Tax Advances.

Mr. Rashid: Well, like I said, this ends a part of our meeting that we were going to go into regarding executive session. And so we're at the point in our agenda right now where we have new business. I see the resolution A, B, and C. Everyone take a look at your copy of these.

Mr. Silvera: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to read resolution 12-01-2019. Members of the finance committee have met, discussed, and reviewed the following items and hereby recommend approval to the library board of trustees. Resolution 12012019 to receive tax advances for fiscal year 2020. Whereas the county treasurer requires board approval to receive tax advances. Whereas tax advances will be credited to our star Ohio account according to the following schedule. First half, First deposit date 01/15/2020. First half, advance number two, deposit date February 14th, 2020. First half settlement deposit date, March, 13, 2020. Last half advance deposit date, July 15th, 2020. Second half settlement deposit date, August 14th 2020. We have resolved the board of trustees of the library to move for its adoption.

Mr. Rashid: Do I hear second?

Dr. Harris: Second.

Mr. Rashid: The resolution has been moved and second. Mr. Turner, please call the roll.

Mr. Mays: ...If there is no further discussion.

Mr. Rashid: Oh, I'm sorry. Is there any discussion on the matter?

Mr. Mays: This is something done every year, is that correct?

Mr. Rashid: Yes, it is.

Mr. Mays: All right.

Mr. Rashid: Mr. Turner, please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Mr. Silvera moved and Dr. Harris seconds resolution 12-01-2019 the Approval of the 2020 Tax Advances.

Motion passes.

Resolution
12-01-2019 is
approved.

B. Resolution 12-02-2019: To Approve 2020 Temporary Appropriations.

Mr. Rashid: We have a second resolution?

Mr. Silvera: We have a second resolution.

Mr. Silvera: Mr. Chairman, I move for the members of the finance committee have met and discussed and reviewed the following items resolution 12-02-2019 approval of the 2020 temporary appropriation. First, I ask if Mr. Cockfield can give us a complete overview of the temporary appropriation and answer the questions that any trustee may have.

Mr. Cockfield: Thank you, Mr. Silvera. The board or the library is required to pass a temporary appropriations measure by December 31st and what this represents is a budget that will carry us through March 31st of next year. At which time we will come to the board with a permanent appropriation asking for a permanent budget that carries us from March 31st through 12/31 of 2020. So this is a temporary measure allowing us to set certain line item limits which we intend to monitor for the next few months.

Mr. Cockfield: Again, at which time we'll come to the board asking for a revision and a permanent budget. We have discussed, I can say that Mr. Latimer and myself and the team have been working on this for the past two and a half months at least trying to nail down very specifically the kinds of things that we intend to do for the next year. Anticipating minor revisions in March when we come to the board with a permanent resolution. So this is a well thought out budget. We believe that it's fiscally responsible and we request your passage.

Mr. Mays: So, the total funding, then, that you asking for is \$2,401,633.90.

Mr. Cockfield: Yes, sir, that's all funds. That includes our general fund, building fund, performing arts center fund, a permanent fund and the Flewellen fund, so we're carrying five funds. The 2,400,000 represents appropriations for all five.

Mr. Mays: Okay.

Mr. Rashid: The question that I got is that this amount is the total for the whole year.

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Mr. Rashid: In the budget that you did, we review it again in March at the end of the first quarter?

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Mr. Rashid: Okay. Any other discussion?

Mr. Cockfield: I can also say that since the judge and Dr. Rice are here, during that March meeting, we're also going to be presented to the board a tax budget, which basically represents an anticipation of what our expenditures are going to be for 2021 and then we'll be asking the school board to pass that tax budget in their board meeting probably in the April or My next year.

Mr. Mays: Is there an increase? Or it's just a regular...

Mr. Cockfield: You're talking about for the tax?

Mr. Mays: Tax, yes.

Mr. Cockfield: No, we're not anticipating any increase in taxes and we're not putting forth any new millage. It basically we're asking the school boards to substantiate tax revenue that we're going to be receiving in addition to the PLF revenue, which we figure is going to cover whatever expenditures is going to be in 2021.

Mr. Rashid: It almost sounds like we're in a really good situation and a kind of turmoil situation because all of them are losing tax value in the community. At the same time, we have a director who was being very frugal in the way he spends our money. You being very good or the way you manage our money, and at the same time we were beginning to generate more grants, so it seems to be things are on the right track for the library.

Mr. Cockfield: Yes.

Ms. McClarin: And don't forget the PACE loan...

Mr. Rashid: That saved us a lot of money. Absolutely.

Ms. McClarin: That's a big item.

Mr. Rashid: Yes, ma'am.

Mr. Silvera: I move for the adoption of...

Mr. Rashid: ...He has one more question.

Mr. Mays: The resolution that I guess we have in front of us, the resolution number 12022019 or resolution to approve 2020 temporary appropriation. Is that correct? Then down here I see in the roll call, the names, it has Tara L. Turner, President Pamela A. McClarin, vice president. That's an error.

Ms. McClarin: Mr. Mays, is that what it reads?

Mr. Mays: Yes, ma'am.

Ms. McClarin: We talked about that.

Mr. Mays: It should be Rashid.

Ms. McClarin: That's the joke. We talked about that in the committee. We just say how sometimes they going to slip through. That's what I said.

Mr. Rashid: It's okay. As long as my name is here and I get a chance to vote, I'm okay with that. But I understand what you said in terms of making sure that we get it grammatically correct.

Ms. McClarin: It's been corrected, this is just probably an old sheet.

Mr. Rashid: Yeah, so we're going to have to send back and get another cover sheet.

Ms. McClarin: We do have up-to-date sheet.

Mr. Silvera: I move for the adoption of the temporary appropriations.

Mr. Rashid: Yeah, okay.

Mr. Mays: Second.

Mr. Rashid: It's been moved and second. All discussions are out of the way. Please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Resolution
12-02-2019 is
approved.

C. Resolution 12-02-2019: To Approve Public Sale.

Mr. Rashid: We're just going to make a note in the files to make sure that we change this cover sheet. Okay.

Mr. Rashid: Okay, we have one more resolution coming up.

Female: Crazy.

Mr. Rashid: Next is resolution 12-03-2019 to approve the public sale.

Mr. Latimer: Yes. It should be in your package.

Mr. Rashid: Resolution number 12. December 3rd, 2019 is a resolution authorizing the director of the East Cleveland Public Library for the public sale of computers, computer equipment and furniture. Am I required to read this entire document?

Mr. Mays: No, it's only...

Mr. Rashid: Okay. By the administration request, sponsored by board member Mr. O. Mays, co-sponsored by myself, Zakee Rashid, whereas the director has identified the computers, computer equipment and furniture that is no longer being used by the library and asking permission to have a public sale. Now therefore be it ordained by the board of East Cleveland Public Library's board or four seventh

concurrent. Section one that the director hereby is authorized to take such actions as in this judgment are necessary to carry out the intent and objectives of this resolution. In section two, be it is found and determined that all formal actions of this board concerning in relation to the passage of this resolution were adopted in an open meeting of the board and that all such deliberations of this board and any of its committees that resulted in such formal actions were in meetings open to the public in compliance with all legal requirements.

Mr. Rashid: Section number three, that this resolution is provided, it receives the affirmative vote or four sevens of the board members. It shall take effect and be enforced immediate upon its passage and approval by the director. Otherwise it shall take effect and be enforced from and after the earliest period of allowed by law. This resolution is also in accords to the Ohio Revised Code allowing for proper notice to the general public via a news statement. Eight.

Mr. Rashid: Be it resolved the adaptation of resolution 12-03-2019 authorizes the East Cleveland Public Library's director to publicly sell computers, computer equipment, and furniture which are unfit for public use during the time, date and location listed below. When? Friday, January 10th, 2019 from 11 AM to 5:30 PM. Where? East Cleveland Public Library's lower auditorium. All proceeds of the sale will be deposited into the East Cleveland Public Library's general funds.

Mr. Mays: Mr. Chairman, I will sponsored this resolution and move for its adoption.

Mr. Silvera: Second.

Mr. Rashid: Hearing a motion and a second. Is there any discussion? Mr. Clerk, please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Mr. Mays moved and Mr. Silvera seconds resolution 12-03-2019 the Approval of Public Sale.

Resolution 12-03-2019 is approved.

D. Nominating Committee

Mr. Rashid: Next item of business and new business is the nominating committee report, and-

Mr. Silvera: Chairman?

Mr. Rashid: Mr. Silvera.

Mr. Silvera: The nominating committee met this evening at 4:30 PM. The committee members were myself to serve it as its chair, Ms. Carol Shaheed, and Mr. O. Mays. Pursuant to resolution that was passed in November, resolution 1106 2019, that board meetings, members of the board were given slips. They nominated. Today, we open up the envelopes and I'll read the results of those calculations. The president, Mr. Rashid, had five votes. Two votes for Mr. Silvera. Vice president, Ms. Turner received two votes. Mr. Mays received two votes. Dr. Harris received one vote. Ms. McClarin received one vote, and Mr. Silvera, myself, received one vote. Secretary, Dr. Harris received two votes. Ms. McClarin received two votes. Ms. Shaheed received one vote and Ms. Turner received one vote.

Ms. Shaheed: I wanted to ask, can we table the election for new members because situation that we're in now is unsettling. I think it'd be more appropriate to vote next month.

Mr. Silvera: We're not voting this month.

Ms. Shaheed: ...To settle it next month.

Mr. Silvera: Yeah, the election is not until next month. We were calculating polls for the positions.

Ms. Shaheed: Okay.

Mr. Silvera: ... for the position. We're not making any recommendations.

Ms. Shaheed: ...Just sharing information. Because I remember last year we did around this time.

Mr. Rashid: Right, I think we...

Ms. Shaheed: So we have a month to make a decision finally about that.

Mr. Silvera: Yeah.

Ms. Shaheed: Okay, good.

Mr. Silvera: So, the presidency, Mr. Rashid has the predominance of votes. Vice president is say tied between Ms. Turner and Mr. Mays, and secretary is tied between Dr. Harris and Ms. McClarin.

Mr. Mays: ...And we'll toss a coin.

Mr. Rashid: Huh?

Ms. McClarin: Don't mind Mays.

Mr. Rashid: At our January meeting, we'll-

Mr. Silvera: We'll resolve...

Mr. Rashid: We'll resolve that issue at that particular time.

Mr. Silvera: Mr. Chairman, that ends the report of the nomination committee.

Mr. Rashid: Do we accept that report?

Ms. Shaheed: Yes, I second. Mm-hmm (affirmative).

Mr. Rashid: I have a motion.

Ms. Shaheed: I move to accept the nomination committee's report.

Dr. Harris: Second.

Mr. Rashid: There's a motion and a second. Is there any more discussion? Mr. Turner, please call the roll.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes)

Yes – 6

Motion passes.

Ms. Shaheed moved and Dr. Harris seconds the approval of the nominating committee's report.

Nominating committee's report accepted.

X. OLD BUSINESS

Mr. Rashid: So the motion carries. We accept the findings of the committee. Next item on our agenda is old business. I don't see anything listed here, but ...

Mr. Mays: Only thing I ... In old business, Mr. Chairman, I would like for the administration or Mr. Carlos (Latimer), give us an update on where we are with the furnace being completed, and what have you.

Mr. Latimer: I'm right here.

Mr. Mays: Oh.

Mr. Latimer: As I commented earlier, we are 99% complete with the boiler. No, we don't have a final punch list to close out the project. However Gardiner the company was in the library today giving our IT, deputy director and our facilities manager the training that they would need for the internal controls, the automation controls, and the steps to move forward. In regards to the air handlers and the Reese Auditorium, we should receive a quote Monday or Tuesday from Gardiner. This in regards to the repair and also the service agreements around the boiler that we discussed the buildings and grounds.

Mr. Mays: I see. Are we going to let that out to the same company, Gardiner, to rectify that situation?

Mr. Latimer: Yes. It's what was recommended as a team. We discussed that we should, because this could tie into our controls, that we are putting a large investment in. It's our best interest to work with them. Yes, sir.

Mr. Rashid: I just want to add to that question that I think that the service contract that we negotiated with them for the main boiler system and throughout the building, it just kind of makes sense for us to adapt the same company with this new issue that we have. So we have one service contract, we have the library blanketed for at least the foreseeable future. And as the first two years go by, we can renegotiate the one for the main boiler system.

Mr. Rashid: But the issue that we're having with the Greg Reese Performing Arts Center is a separate issue altogether. But I just think it's best to have one company handling all of that issue. That's kind of what we talked

about in the buildings and grounds meeting last time, and I think we came to an agreement on that and the contract was not out of the scope of being able to be approved without going through a long, lengthy process.

Mr. Mays: And Mr. Cockfield?

Mr. Cockfield: No, I just wanted to kind of add, we have received an invoice from them for \$80,000 which has been submitted back to NOPEC for them to pay. Once we received the check from NOPEC, we will forward it on to Gardiner, which would then leave a balance of about \$20,000 on the contract.

Mr. Mays: My concern in reference to that, in all honesty and fair to Gardiner and them, they're in violation of the contract and I think they should be penalized for violating the contract. They just let them get away scot-free and we still paying this and here it is they gave us ... I mean, October the 28th. October the 28th has come and gone. Then they said December the 6th that it would be complete. December the 6th has come and gone and we still have not completed everything. What's going on now should be a new contract that we are entering into with them. So, we just cannot let them just come through here and just take us a like a bunch of buffoons that we don't know what we're doing. Any place else, they would have been penalized because they have violated the contract.

Mr. Rashid: Mr. Mays, may I respond to that?

Mr. Mays: Sure, you may respond to it.

Mr. Rashid: As we discussed in our buildings and grounds meeting, I share your sentiments. They are late in terms of being able to totally complete the work, but there are two things I would take in consideration and share them with you during our meeting, that one, we were not never without heat. Part of the system that they had to complete was the integration of the-

Ms. McClarin: Electronics.

Mr. Rashid: ...electronics to actually distribute the heat evenly throughout the building. I also agree with you that perhaps there should have been some sort of a penalty or something but it is not in our contract. I think more importantly is the fact that we pay these people on time, keep and build rapport with them, because they remember that they did acquiesce and give us an additional year service contract that we fought for in the buildings and grounds without charging us another extra dime for that to be responsible for that boiler system. That is

significant to me, and they did go ahead and approve that. So what I'm thinking is that if anything does go wrong, they will have to stand behind from the day we do the punch list for the next two years.

Mr. Mays: I'm cognizant all of that. But that still does not take away from the fact that we entered into a contract, and all parties must honor the contract. And if you do not honor the contract and you have failed, and that Mr. Gutkoski over there is our attorney, and from my perspective and has been dealing with contracts, they are penalized. If it was any other place, they would penalize them because they have not performing the duties in which-

Mr. Rashid: What would be the damages?

Mr. Mays: The damage is that you're saying that we had heat, and we didn't have heat back in October the 28th or whatever because they had not completed, and they went over that, and then they gave us another date was December the 6th, and they have gone over that. They have not been penalized and I would like to hear from our ...

Mr. Turner: Attorney.

Mr. Mays: Attorney, Mr. Gutkoski, in reference to contracts.

Mr. Gutkoski: Well, I didn't write the contract, I didn't see the contract. I can't say. Just hearing the conversation being generally apprised of the situation, the phrase win the battle, lose the war comes to mind.

Mr. Rashid: That's what I'm thinking.

Mr. Mays: But it was my understanding that you were supposed to see ... The contract was supposed to be passed on to before we entered into it. That's what came to this board and now you're saying that you did not receive it, so somebody ... And I'm just going to call it what it is. Somebody lied.

Mr. Mays: Simple as that. Okay. We can move on. It's on the record that I said they should be penalized.

Mr. Rashid: With no further discussion?

Ms. Shaheed: That's how you learn how to write a better contract next time you have a contract and include a penalty cost. If it's not in there, then you have nothing else to say about it. Well, no. If it's not in the contract, then you have no legal basis to go to them about anything.

Mr. Mays: Well, they-

Ms. Shaheed: See, that's how you learn how to better the next time.

Mr. Mays: But in the contract, they said they would be through-

Mr. Rashid: Yes, the chair recognized Ms. McClarin.

Ms. McClarin: Thank you. Since we're still talking about it, Mr. Mays. One thing I did not hear you say too, and I was in one of the meetings, is the fact that as they were working on our furnace and working in our buildings, they were coming up against different little situations that was happening. This happened here, and that's with anything the more you get into it the more you find the loopholes in, okay, this is not working. We got to put this little part in there. Going to take time for this little part to come. But with the board and the buildings ground committee steady talking to them and the director, it has moved quite fast, even from the last meeting. Like he said, when they discussed it about December 6th. So I think that needs to be taken into consideration that at least we're moving. We're not just stuck. And so I think ... And 99%, I think we doing pretty good.

Mr. Rashid: I do, too.

Ms. McClarin: The building is warm. The money is being paid. I'm just saying that's one of the loopholes I didn't see you mention. That's all.

Mr. Mays: Thank you for that. Mr. Latimer here to my right, have they ever said anything to you in reference to that they ran into some problems? It's my understanding, no.

Mr. Latimer: No. Early in the process, A lot of things we didn't find out till we brought them to the buildings and grounds meetings to ask the question.

Mr. Rashid: Okay. Well, hearing no further discussion, then I guess we can go around in circles. I guess the main thing out of this whole thing is that the system is working as best as it can work right now. The new electronics have been installed and once we get to punch list...

Mr. Mays: ...We just accept anything.

Mr. Rashid: ...We can beat them up on the new deal, Mr. Mays.

Mr. Mays: All right. I hear you.

XI. AUDIENCE PARTICPATION

Mr. Rashid: Okay, next. Moving on to the next thing in our agenda is the audience participation. Does anyone in the audience have anything to say? Okay, well, the next item on our agenda is the adjournment of our meeting.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Shaheed: I move for adjourning.

Ms. McClarin: I second.

Mr. Rashid: It has been moved and second. Clerk, please call the roll, sir.

Mr. Mays: Is that 8:05?

Ms. McClarin: Yes, it is.

Mr. Rashid: 8:05.

Discussion: None

Roll Call Vote: Ms. Turner (yes), Mr. Rashid (yes), Dr. Harris (yes), Ms. McClarin (yes), Mr. Mays (yes), Mr. Silvera (yes), Ms. Shaheed (yes),

Yes – 7

Motion passes.

[Meeting adjourned at 08:06 pm]

Ms. Shaheed moved and Ms. McClarin seconds adjournment.

Meeting is adjourned.

(Board of Trustee Meeting Minutes for 12/16/2019 were approved by the full Board on 01/23/2020)

(Signature not yet available)

Ms. Terra Turner, President

(Signature not yet available)

Dr. Mary Ann Harris, Secretary